Chapter 1:  Pater in the 1990s, Laurel Brake & Ian Small


Chapter 2:  Estrangement and Connection: Walter Pater, Benjamin Jowett, and William M. Hardinge, Billie Andrew Inman


4. Ibid.


6. Ibid., 60.

7. In a telephone conversation in November 1985, Richard Ellmann directed me to Dr. Kadish, who directed me to the Gell family and to Hardinge's article on Jowett cited herein. I express gratitude to Dr. Kadish and to Major Gell, who provided
the letters for me to read and gave me permission to quote from them and photocopy them. The series of letters from the Gell Correspondence that I cite are the B series (Arnold Toynbee), and the MIL series (Alfred Milner). The letters have been laminated, arranged by dates, numbered, and placed in manila envelopes. I read Toynbee's letters to Philip Lyttleton Gell, 1873-1881; Jowett's letters to Gell 1873-1892 [Series A; none cited]; and Milner's to Gell, 1873-1879. MIL 6, 7, and 8, the most pertinent to the paper, are in an envelope labelled 1874. The numbers and dates correspond to those given in the National Register of Archives, listed by T. W. M. Jaine for the Royal Commission on Historical Manuscripts in 1975, of which the Derbyshire County Record Office in Matlock has a copy. Much of the correspondence is of a business type, related mainly to the British South Africa Company. The personal correspondence is in Section VI: Correspondence Mostly Between P. L. Gell and Alfred Milner (cr. Viscount Milner, 1902). Most of the pertinent letters are in subdivision HMC/64. Milner also saved an extensive body of correspondence which is now held by the Bodleian Library and indexed in a separate Catalogue. However, no letters pertaining to Hardinge are indexed.

8. Hardinge states that he "had the misfortune to lose both . . . [his] parents in ten months" (William Money Hardinge, "Some Personal Recollections of the Master of Balliol," Temple Bar 103 [October 1894]; repr. in Littel's Living Age 203 [1 December 1894], 557), and that after his father's death he "paid the master a visit of many days at his own house, dating from Monday, February 28th, 1876 . . . a visit during which his house was literally mine, whether he was there or away." The death date of Hardinge's father, Henry Hardinge, M.D., is given in the Calendar of the Grants of Probate and Letters of Administration Made in the Probate Registries (London, 1876) at Somerset House, London, as 28 January 1876. Milner tells Gell on 6 February 1876: "Hardinge has lost his fathergreat loss I should think" (MIL 1/20). Hardinge's mother, Jane Hardinge, had died on 26 March 1875 of cerebral hemorrhage, with her son present (death certificate from St. Catherine's House, London).

9. Ellmann, Oscar Wilde, 60.


11. Ellmann, Oscar Wilde, 61.

13. Gell Correspondence, B1/1.


15. B 1/2. This paragraph continues as follows: "Milner will tell you more: now [next word smudged] but his real friends know the circumstances & of course you will say nothing about them: Hardinge was really very grateful to you for all your kindness & seemed to feel your not being up during the matter very much: he had a sort of wish to go down by the same sea-side place as you: but I fancy there are very strong objections which you will understand: though I think in some respects the plan is a good one. Especially I don't think for your sake, in your present state of health it would be at all good, though you know best about that, of course." Toynbee's letter, with full date, 11 March 1874, contains this line: "Hardinge seemed very sensible to your kind offer to go with him to the sea." But apparently they did not go. Toynbee wrote Gell on 9 April 1874: "Will you write to Hardinge? He is lonely I'm afraid, though his never-ending doubleness of which he seems hardly conscious is reason enough for men ceasing to have to do with him but nothing but infinite patience from the few of us who have tried to help him can save him for his father plainly says he will turn him from the house if anything of the kind happens again and if that does happen God knows what will become of him." B 1/3.

16. MIL 1/6.

17. MIL 1/7.

18. MIL 1/8.


20. Ibid., 554.

21. Ibid., 561.


23. It has been suggested "Miss Pater" might refer to Pater himself. I do not think so. Such a usage would have been out of keeping with the style of Milner's letters. Although Milner was capable of levity, irony, and sarcasm, he treats Hardinge's crisis consistently with straightforward seriousness. Also, I think that if Pater had been trying to send Hardinge home, Milner would have felt prompted to comment either on Pater's duplicity or Hardinge's misinterpretation of the relationship. In the nineteenth century "Miss" was the title of the eldest unmarried sister; I therefore thought at first that Hester, not Clara, would have been "Miss Pater."
However, Sir Michael Levey has convinced me that the sister who took action is more likely to have been Clara than Hester: "Although of course Miss Pater was, as you say, the proper form for referring to the elder sister, anyone not aware of her or of the sisters' ages might have referred in that way to Clara. . . . To illustrate . . . I cite Wilde's letter to Wemyss Reid (Hart-Davis, 1962, 195), where he writes of hoping to get among contributors to the Lady's World, in 1887, 'Miss Pater,' where surely he meant Clara? Clara's gravitating all the time towards university circles is possibly another pointer to considering if it was she who became involved" (Letter dated 21 August 1988).

24. Leonard Montefiore was destined to have an even shorter life than Arnold Toynbee. After studying law, he returned to Balliol and took his B.A. in 1878. Then he went out to Newport, Rhode Island, where in 1879 he died.

25. Mallock had taken the B.A. in 1874, but apparently had remained at Oxford. He had never lodged in college. Book I, Chapter I-III, of The New Republic would appear in Belgravia four months later, or June 1876, and the serial publication would extend to December. Mallock, who had won the Newdigate Prize for Poetry in 1871, had published Every Man His Own Poet, The Inspired Singer's Recipe Book in 1872, in which he had given the recipe for writing a poem like Tennyson, Browning, Arnold, and others. He had by this time written most of the poems that were to appear in Poems by William Hurrell Mallock (New York: George W. Fitch, 1880). While The New Republic was appearing in Belgravia, he published an article entitled "The Golden Ass of Apuleius" in Fraser's Magazine (n.s. 14 [1876], 363-74). He published his central philosophical book, Is Life Worth Living? (New York: John Wurtels Lovell), dedicated to Ruskin, in 1880. Mallock believed that unless modern man could find a new basis for religious faith, he would sink deeper and deeper into misery. The position that he advocates in this book is exactly that described by Pater in "The Will as Vision" in Marius the Epicurean, the only difference being that Marius was able to effect the will to believe only once or twice and Mallock thought it to be the only acceptable state of mind.


29. Ibid., 79.

30. Ibid., 80-82.
31. Ibid., 87.


33. Ibid., II, 130.

34. *Monumens du culte secret des dames romaines, pour servir de suite aux Monumens de la vie privée des XII Césars* [by Pierre François Hugues, called d'Hancarville], who states that it was published by Sabellus in Caprée, in 1784. For a discussion of this book, see my "Laurence's Uncle's Book, or Shades of Baron d'Hancarville in Mallock's *New Republic*," *ELT Special Series No. 4* (1990), 67-76.


36. Ibid.


39. The remainder of the sonnet is as follows:

    One was Narcissus by a wood-side well,
    And on the moss his limbs and feet were white;
    And one, Queen Venus, blown in for my delight
    Across the blue sea in a rosy shell;
    And one, a lean Aquinas in his cell,
    Kneeling, his pen in hand, with aching sight
    Strained towards a carven Christ; and of these
    three
    I knew not which was fairest. First I turned
    Towards the soft boy, who laughed and fled from me;
    Towards Venus then; and she smiled once, and she
    Fled also. Then with teeming heart I yearned,
    O Angel of the Schools, towards Christ with thee!
    (II, 130-31)

Either Hardinge or Mallock was capable of writing this sonnet, but presumably Mallock wrote it, since it is a part of his book and since it expresses a type of
eclecticism that was anathema to him.


45. Ibid., 562.


47. If Raffalovich's use of *saw* in this passage is literal, the reference cannot be to Hardinge's first encounter with Pater, since Raffalovich was only ten years old in 1874.


50. *Pater and His Reading, 1874-1877, with a Bibliography of His Library Borrowings, 1878-1894* (New York: Garland, 1990), especially pp. xxiv-xxxiii, 140, 204.


**Chapter 3: Editing Pater's *Gaston de Latour*: The Unfinished Work as "A Fragment of Perfect Expression", Gerald Monsman**


10. Unpublished correspondence, Bodleian Library, University of Oxford. See also Shadwell's letter to Clara of 7 September 1894 and his preface to *Greek Studies* (1896).

**Chapter 4: Editing and Annotating Pater, Ian Small**


2. The Pater correspondence in Macmillan archive in the British Library contains no reference to any edition after the 1892.


12. Ibid., 19-20.


**Chapter 5: The Discourses of Journalism: "Arnold and Pater" Againand Wilde, Laurel Brake**


12. [Anon. review], "Macmillan and Co.," *Bookman*, 1 (1891), 34.


26. Ibid., xvii.


32. Frank Harris, "Walter Pater," 215.

33. Frank Harris, *Oscar Wilde, His Life and Confessions*, 2 vols. (New York, Frank Harris, 1918). Harris claims that Pater refused his request out of awareness of personal danger, and finally wrote a review out of a sense of duty. While the *Fortnightly* continued to publish Wilde's most controversial work after *The Picture of Dorian Gray* appeared, it never published a review of the novel.


**Chapter 6: An Anxiety of No Influence: Walter Pater on William Wordsworth, J. P. Ward**


6. Ibid., 221-22.


9. Ibid., 49-50.


15. Ibid., 52-58.

16. Ibid., 52.


18. Ibid., 38.


20. Ibid., 7-12.


**Chapter 7: Essaying "W. H. Pater Esq.": New Perspectives on the Tutor/Student Relationship Between Pater and Hopkins, Lesley Higgins**


6. Liddon MS. Diary, 1864, entries for 8 and 10 February. The diaries are the property of Liddon House, St. Margaret's Church (Mayfair), London.

7. According to Edmund Gosse, Jowett was "so struck with [Pater's] power that he very generously offered to coach him for nothing" in 1860. (See *Critical Kit-Kats* [New York: Dodd, Mead and Co., 1896], 248). Monsman states that "during the 1861 Lent term" Pater "prepared a weekly essay" for Jowett (Monsman, *Walter Pater*, 24). Both sources repeat the story that Jowett once confided to Pater, "I think you have a mind that will come to great eminence." Pater's tribute to Jowett can be found in Lawrence Evans, ed., *Letters of Walter Pater* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1970), 267.

8. Samuel Brooke (1844-1898) was at Corpus Christi College from 1862 to 1866. Cleverness got Brooke elected to the Old Mortality Society in February 1863, approximately the same time as Pater joined; narrow-mindedness impelled him to quit the Society a year later and establish his own rival organization, the Hexameron Society. Brooke's diaries are housed in Corpus Christi, MS. CCC 498 (1-6). The quotations are cited from the entries for 20 and 29 Feb. 1864. See also Monsman, "Old Mortality at Oxford," *Studies in Philology*, 67 (1970), 359-89; and *Walter Pater*, 30-31. Pertinent excerpts from Brooke's diary are published in Seiler, *Walter Pater: A Life Remembered*, 11-13.


13. Brasenose brewed its own beer until 1886. Its lone literary distinction was that every Shrove Tuesday a new set of "Ale verses" was recited at the college's pancake supper party. In 1885, E. F. MacPherson penned an affectionate lampoon of Pater. See *Brasenose College Quatercentenary Monographs* (Oxford, 1909), II, 297.


17. A notebook now catalogued as MS. D.XII in the Campion Hall, Oxford Collection.

18. D.XII, f.1.


21. Ibid.

22. Ibid.

23. Jowett's lists of prospective essay topics are found among his papers in the Jowett Collection of Balliol College, Oxford.


25. D.III.6, f.18.

27. D.III.1, f.1.

28. Ibid., ff.1 and 4.


31. Ibid., 57.

32. D.III.1, f.3 and f.4.


35. D.III.1, f.5.


37. See especially Hopkins's essay "The Life of Socrates" (D.II.6), a paper of 1865 written for Jowett.


40 D.III.3, f.10.

41. Ibid.

42. D.III.3, f.9

43. In several outlines for lectures written in the 1857-1865 period Jowett analyzes "Whether virtue or knowledge can be taught?" and whether "knowledge is virtue" (Jowett Collection, Box B). See also Hopkins's essay "The Life of Socrates" (D.II.6).

44. D.III.6, f.21.

46. Ibid., 193-94.

47. D.III.6, ff.21-22.


49. D.VI.7.

50. For Pater's translation of *Symposium*, Steph. 210, see *Plato and Platonism*, 121-23.

51. D.III.4, f.15.

52. Ibid.


54. D.XII.1, f.1.

55. Ibid., f.2.


58. D.IX.3.

59. Ibid., f.1.

60. Although "Winckelmann" appears in *The Renaissance*, I shall be quoting from the serial version of the essay that Hopkins would have read at that time. "Winckelmann," *Westminster Review*, 87 (1867), 36-50.

61. *Miscellaneous Studies*, 16.

62. "Winckelmann," 50. In his "Prefix" to *The Renaissance*, Pater is much more
63. According to Lionel Tollemache, Jowett's response to a student "who had been reading him an essay with a strong metaphysical flavour" was: "It is remarkable what a fascination metaphysics seems to possess for the human mind. It is like falling in love. But you get over it after a time." See Lionel Tollemache, *Benjamin Jowett, Master of Balliol* (London: Edward Arnold, 1895), 72-73.

64. "Coleridge's Writings," 49.

65. Ibid., 48.


67. Ibid., ff.7-8.

68. Ibid., ff.8-9.

69. Ibid., f.9.

70. "Winckelmann," 45.


73. D.V.1.

74. Notes from an undated (1850s-1860s) black leather-covered notebook, inscribed inside the front cover, "1. True art colourless like water." (Jowett Collection, Balliol College, Box B). Another thick notebook containing "Lectures on Greek Literature Nov. 1871" reveals that Jowett punctuated his discourse with references to classical inscriptions, monuments and statues, especially the "monuments to be found in the British Museum" (Jowett Collection, Balliol College, Box A, f.20).

75. Jowett Collection, Box B, ff.1-2.

76. D.III.1, f.1.

77. D.III.2, f.7.


80. *The Renaissance*, 141.


82. D.III.5, f.17.

83. Ibid., f.15v.

84. Ibid., f.18.


86. Ibid., 55.


89. Pater employs this unusual term to great advantage in his essay on "Coleridge's Writings." The "unity of aim" in Greek philosophy is the function of an "unfixed poetical prepossession" (54); morality is described as "a groundless prepossession until transformed into a religious recognition of a spiritual world" (56).

90. D.XII, ff.7-8.


---

**Chapter 8: Pater Speaking Bloom Speaking Joyce, F. C. McGrath**


18. Since most of the Pater passages Joyce copied into his notebook are not memorable, I have listed them below for anyone who desires to pursue Joyce's use of Pater further. Joyce's transcriptions contain inaccuracies and he did not identify the passages except to list some under the heading of "Marius the Epicurean" and some under the heading of "Imaginary Portraits." All those he listed as being from *Marius* are from volume one. Of those he listed under "Imaginary Portraits," eleven are from *Imaginary Portraits* and the last four are from volume two of *Marius*. The order below is the order in which they appear in Joyce's notebook (*James Joyce: Notes, Criticism, Translations, & Miscellaneous Writings*, Hans

They comprehended a multitude . . . in which were those well-remembered roses. (*Marius the Epicurean* [London: Macmillan, 1910], I, 106-07).

Down the dewy paths the people were descending . . . like a wild picture drawn from Virgil. (*Marius*, I, 161-62).

The temple of Antoninus and Faustina was still fresh . . . though the birds had built freely among them. (*Marius*, I, 173).

Marius could distinguish, could distinguish clearly, the well known profile, between the floating purple curtains. (*Marius*, I, 177).

The nostrils and mouth seemed capable almost of peevishness . . . the flesh had scarcely been an equal gainer with the spirit. (*Marius*, I, 191).

The discourse ended almost in darkness . . . and at no time had the winter roses from Carthage seemed more lustrously yellow and red. (*Marius*, I, 211).

It might be almost edifying . . . as neatly as if it were a stocking . . . (*Marius*, I, 239). [At the beginning of this quotation Joyce wrote in parentheses "Marsyas."]

And meantime those dreams of remote and probably adventurous travel . . . in the foldings of the hillside. ("Duke Carl of Rosenmold," *Imaginary Portraits*, 134).

. . . a marvellous tact of omission . . . ("A Prince of Court Painters," *Imaginary Portraits*, 6). [After this quotation Joyce wrote in parentheses "Watteau."]

Methinks I see him there . . . over which the sun is sinking. ("A Prince of Court Painters," *Imaginary Portraits*, 10).

. . . "The evening will be a wet one." . . . and the secular trees themselves will hardly outlast another generation. ("A Prince of Court Painters," *Imaginary Portraits*, 32).
He was always a seeker after something in the world that is there in no satisfying measure, or not at all. ("A Prince of Court Painters," *Imaginary Portraits*, 44).


. . . a flask of lively green glass . . . ("Denys L'Auxerrois," *Imaginary Portraits*, 56).


From a comfortless portico . . . the like of which one was used to hear. ("Duke Carl of Rosenmold," *Imaginary Portraits*, 127).

. . . the young Duke had often peered at the faded glories of the immense coroneted coffins, the oldest shedding their velvet tatters around them. ("Duke Carl of Rosenmold," *Imaginary Portraits*, 138).

. . . his goodwill sunned her wild-grown beauty into majesty . . . in the wood-sides and on the hilltops. ("Duke Carl of Rosenmold," *Imaginary Portraits*, 148-49).


Lastly, herb and tree had taken possession . . . against the wide realms of sunset. (Marius, II, 96).

Men and women came to the altar successively . . . with an increasing mysticity and effusion the rite proceeded. (Marius, II, 137).

Among the captives . . . in his misshapen features, and the pale,
servile, yet angry eyes. (Marius, II, 197).


26. Ibid., 305.

27. Ibid., 301.

28. Ibid., 302.

29. Joyce, Ulysses, 344.

30. Ibid., 320.


32. Joyce, Ulysses, 94-95.

33. Ibid., 344.

34. A. Walton Litz, The Art of James Joyce, 36.


**Chapter 9: Pater as a "Moralist", Paul Tucker**


2. "He began as an aesthete, and ended as a moralist. By faithful and self-restraining cultivation of the sense of harmony, he appears to have risen from the perception of visible beauty to the knowledge of beauty of the spiritual kind, both being expressions of the same perfect fittingness to an ever more intense and various and congruous life"; repr. in Robert Seiler, ed. *Walter Pater: The Critical Heritage* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1980), 294. Cf. Ruth Child's comment: "He began his work with an emphasis on art for art's sake, but progressed gradually to a greater and greater emphasis on the ethical function of art." (*The Aesthetic of Walter Pater* [1940; New York: Octagon, 1969], 10.)


7. Fraser, *Beauty and Belief*, 198.

8. Ibid.

9. Ibid., 199-200.

10. Ibid.
11. Ibid., 201.


15. Ibid.


20. Ibid., 630.

21. "Sympathy, appreciation, a sense of latent claims in things which even ordinary good men pass rudely by these on the whole are the characteristic traits of its artists [the artists of the Renaissance], though it may still be true that 'aesthetic propriety, rather than strict conceptions of duty, ruled the conduct even of the best'; and at least they never 'destroyed pity in their souls' " (Pater, review [1875] of The Renaissance in Italy: The Age of the Despots, by J. A. Symonds; repr. in The Renaissance: Studies in Art and Poetry: The 1893 Text, Donald Hill, ed. [Berkeley: University of California Press, 1980], 199).

22. "And, working ever close to the concrete, to the details, great or small, of actual things, books, persons, and with no part of them blurred to his vision by the intervention of mere abstract theories, he has reached an enduring moral effect also, in a sort of boundless sympathy" (Pater, Appreciations, 109).

23. Pater, Appreciations, 184.

24. T. R. Wright, The Religion of Humanity: The Impact of Comtean Positivism on


30. Ibid., 311.


37. "The true and immediate mode of being in the divine idea requires of us that we become, and therefore that we deplore our being's standing still at any given moment" (Fichte, *Werke*, VI, 387); "The following rule is good for all men, and even more for the scholar. Let him forget what he has done as soon as he has done
it, and let him think only of what he still has to do" (Fichte, *Werke*, VI, 329). (All translations from Fichte are my own.)


39. Ibid.


41. "To suppose that what is called 'ontology' is what the speculative spirit seeks, is the misconception of a backward school of logicians. Who would change the colour or curve of a roseleaf for that *ousia achromatos, asahematistos, anaphes* ("colourless, formless, intangible essence" [transcribed from Greek in original])? A transcendentalism that makes what is abstract more excellent than what is concrete has nothing akin to the leading philosophies of the world. The true illustration of the speculative temper is not the Hindoo, lost to sense, understanding, individuality; but such an one as Goethe, to whom every moment of life brought its share of experimental, individual knowledge, by whom no touch of the world of form, colour, and passion was disregarded" ("Coleridge's Writings," 423). As a measure of the distance between Pater and Fichte with regard to the ontological status of the self, it is to be noted that in *Die Anweisung zum seligen Leben* Fichte adopts precisely the Platonic terminology (*Phaedrus*, 247 C) that Pater rejects above to express the self's divine parentage, notwithstanding its otherwise finite condition: "What you see is eternally you yourself; but you are not it as you see it, nor do you see it as you are it. You are it in so far as you are unchanging, pure, without form or colour. Only this reflection, which is you yourself, and from which you therefore can never separate yourself; only the reflection breaks it up into infinite rays and forms" (Fichte, *Werke*, V, 458).


43. Ibid., 311.

44. But through its association with art the morality of "sympathy" itself acquires a broader, theoretical significance. For art may be seen as a model not only of judgment but also of representation.


47. The confluence of ethical and theoretical motives in Pater's ethic of "passion" may be illustrated by a further comparison with classical ethics, especially with the ethical systems of the Hellenistic philosophies, with their private outlook and
defensive, consolatory stance. If "[p]hilosophy, as many have said, responded to the unsettled age of the Hellenistic monarchs by turning away from disinterested speculation to the provision of security for the individual" (A. A. Long, *Hellenistic Philosophy: Stoics, Epicureans, Sceptics* [2nd ed. London: Duckworth, 1986], 3), Pater's ethic of "passion" answers a similar need, although the state of insecurity it moves from is not of a political but of a theoretical order: modern philosophy and natural science had seemingly undermined the very fabric of experience. The theoretical concerns of the "Conclusion" explain why one might, practically speaking, think it "almost anticlimactic" (Stein, *The Ritual of Interpretation*, 256).

48. DeLaura says that Pater "uses a swarm of words suggesting refined, passive, sensuous, largely visual experience—observation, mood, insight, variegated, dramatic, see, senses, eye, lifted horizon, strange dyes and flowers, curious odors, art works, the face of one's friend, discriminate, splendor of experience, see and touch, curiously test new opinions, new impressions, regard which beget a second swarm of terms suggesting intense momentary thrills, frissons: delicious recoil, race, drift, flight, tremulous, dissolution, pulsations, rouse, startle, ecstasy, exquisite passion, excitement, irresistibly real and attractive, the focus of 'vital forces', melts, grasp, stirring, desperate effort, 'courting' impressions" (DeLaura, *Hebrew and Hellene*, 226). It seems to me that DeLaura's characterization of the kind of experience named by his first group as "passive" has to some extent confused the two sets of terms, and that as a result certain words have been misplaced. Moreover, although his aim is to give a picture of the "Paterian ideal" through Pater's key-words, he has indiscriminately included terms from the earlier, expository paragraphs of the "Conclusion," whose referent is not the subject addressed or described in the final paragraphs.

49. Unlike German, English does not have two words to express these two different conceptions of experience. For an account of the separation of the concept of "Erlebnis" (an) immediately lived experience from that of "Erfahrung" the having experience of something in the second half of the nineteenth century, see Hans-Georg Gadamer, *Truth and Method* (2nd ed. London: Sheed and Ward, 1979), 55-63; and Leonardo Amoroso, *L'estetica come problema* (Pisa: ETS, 1988).


51. From the Greek for "things perceptible by the senses."

52. Pater, "Coleridge's Writings," 422-23.

53. Ibid., 423.

54. As perhaps all scepticism does. Cf. Merleau-Ponty: "Le scepticisme a deux


57. Ibid., 305.

58. Ibid.

59. Ibid., 303.

60. Ibid., 312.


63. Ibid., 7-8.

64. Cf. Richard Wollheim, who unjustifiably limits Pater's interest in Hegel's schematic distinction between Form and Content to one "registered predominantly on a more psychological level." (Wollheim, "Walter Pater as a Critic of the Arts," in *On Art and the Mind* [London: Allen Lane, 1973], 171-72.)


66. Ibid., 230.

67. Cf. Wolfgang Iser, who makes a similar point about Pater's criticism of Renaissance painting, but robs it of positive theoretic point by subordinating it to the pure indeterminacy of what he calls "mood": "Art, then, is an in-between region of undecidedness, separating itself from a single metaphysical interpretation of the world without being committed to rejecting such an interpretation. . . . Mood has replaced metaphysical hierarchies, and for Pater it is mood that determines art. . . . Art removes the intentionality of a challenging reality, and replaces it with a transitional reality that neither rejects the old nor the new, but remains a mood in which contrasts lose their firm outlines and begin to

68. Pater, The Renaissance, 125.

69. Ibid., 231.


72. Ibid., 56.

73. Cf. Iser: "The inherent contradictions impair the symbolic qualities of the paintings [of the Madonna and of Venus]. Yet this seems to have been done deliberately; the gradual effacing of the symbolic significance gives expression to an emerging mood" (Walter Pater: The Aesthetic Moment, 41).

Chapter 10: Critical Impressionism as Anti-Phallogocentric Strategy, Richard Dellamora


6. Ibid., 104. [Love is the] father of delicacy, of splendour, of luxury, of the Graces, of desire, and of longing.
7. Ibid., 103-104.


13. Ibid., 106.


17. Quoted by Miller, 102.

18. Ibid., 106.

19. Ibid., 112.


22. Crawford, 867.

1955).


25. Ibid., 859.


27. Pater, Miscellaneous Studies, 188.


29. Ibid., 109.

30. Ibid.


33. See Ibid., 17.

34. See Peter Clarke, Liberals and Social Democrats (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1978).


43. Ibid., II, 68.

44. Ibid., II, 72.

45. Ibid., II, 70.

46. O'Hara, *The Romance of Interpretation*, 41; emphasis added.


48. The final phrase is from the second edition of 1885, II, 110.


51. Ibid., 105.

52. Miller, 101.

53. In the present context, by revisionary masculine discourses I mean discourses which attempt to enlarge masculine capacities for relationship while remaining principally concerned with male-female relations. See Percy Bysshe Shelley, *Complete Works*, 10 vols; Roger Ingpen and Walter E. Peck, eds. (London: Benn, 1965), VI, 325; and, as I indicate below, Pater's "Denys l'Auxerrois."


55. Ibid., 54.


58. Miller, 112.


60. Ibid., 100 fn. 21.


62. Ibid., 164.


**Chapter 11: "The Last Thing Water Wrote": Pater's "Pascal", Hayden Ward**


3. Clara Pater's letter of transmittal to Gosse, dated 13 November 1895, prefaces the bound manuscript, in the Bodleian Library (Ms. Don d. 84).


5. Conlon, 155-56.


9. Ibid., 80.

10. Ibid., 63.

11. Ibid., 67.


14. Although Pater does not say so explicitly, the process he describes Pascal as undergoing, as his commitment to Jansenism deepens, is analogous to the process of Newman's gradual turning away from the ahistorical Anglican Church to the truly "developed" Roman Church. The apparently casual reference to Newman's *Apologia* that Pater makes in defining the tone of *The Provincial Letters* has implications throughout the entire essay on Pascal.

15. Ibid., 70.

16. Ibid., 77. Somewhat overstating the case, Germain D'Hangest concludes his analysis of the Pascal essay by applying the term *agonia* to the tension, in Pater himself, of residual skepticism and the will to believe (D'Hangest, 2: 252).

17. Hugh Davidson writes of *Port-Royal* (1840) that Sainte-Beuve "evokes [an] image of Pascal, that of the reader of Montaigne and the man of the world who brought into a theological debate new notes of humor, playfulness, and a certain fashionable indifference," in *Blaise Pascal* (Boston: Twayne, 1983), 114-15. These are the qualities that Pater, too, emphasizes in discussing *The Provincial*


20. Ibid., 53.


26. In the introduction to his translation of the *Pensées* (21), Krailsheimer disputes the accuracy of calling the Jansenists "Calvinists" of the Roman Catholic Church; moreover, he says that Pascal cannot be called a "Jansenist" except by way of loose affiliation. However, that Pater believed him a kind of Calvinist is explicit in his essay.

27. See Davidson, 85: "One may safely say, I think, that every important term in the *Pensées* is involved in some kind of semantic paradox." Davidson's comments on Pascal's "nongeometrical way of defining words" help to explain what Pater regards as a puzzling, and disabling, contradiction.


29. "The Writings of Cardinal Newman," Houghton Ms. bMsEng1150 (12). Although it is undated, the essay may be from the early 1880s, when Pater was planning *Marius the Epicurean*, a work much indebted to Newman's *Grammar of
Assent (as DeLaura explains in Hebrew and Hellene, 314-26), which was originally published in 1870 and appeared in a new edition in 1881. The Grammar is a recurring focal point in Pater's discontinuous manuscript pages. As its title indicates, Pater's manuscript cannot date from before 1879.

30. As DeLaura notes (308), Pater's passing allusion to Newman in the essay on Winckelmann (The Renaissance: Studies in Art and Poetry: The 1893 Text, Donald L. Hill, ed. [Berkeley: University of California Press, 1980], 159) defines Newman as a champion of the idea of "culture." The view is much the same in the incomplete, unpublished essay of several years later. Needless to say, DeLaura, a distinguished Catholic scholar, finds Pater's understanding of Newman inadequate, because it is much too selective.

**Chapter 12: The Historiography of Studies in the History of the Renaissance, J. B. Bullen**


4. Ibid., 137-38.

5. Ibid., 137.


11. Ibid., 45.

12. Ibid., 44.


18. Ibid., 308.

19. Ibid., 305.


24. Ibid., 16.


**Chapter 13: Pater's Mythic Fiction: Gods in a Gilded Age, M. F. Moran**


3. Ibid., 74, 76.


7. Ibid., 75.


13. Ibid., 2.


15. Ibid., 22-23.

16. Ibid., 3.


18. McGrath, 149-50.


20. Ibid., 95.

21. Ibid., 22.

22. Ibid., 23.


25. Ibid., 13-14.

26. Ibid., 111.

27. Ibid., 23.

28. Ibid., 111.
29. Ibid., 37.

30. Ibid., 28-29. Gerald Monsman identifies the centrifugal tendency with Dionysus, the centripetal with Apollo. He suggests that Pater's own aesthetic propensity for order, rationality, and the ultimate expression of the Absolute can be seen in his typical (Apollonian) heroes who nonetheless share with Dionysus an incarnation "in time and space . . . enduring the pangs of death" (Pater's Portraits: Mythic Patterns in the Fiction of Walter Pater [Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1967], 18, 22). It is worth noting, however, that in "Denys L'Auxerrois" and "Apollo in Picardy" the displaced god figures seem to share many common features, and these similarities tend to overshadow Nietzschean readings like those of Monsman and Lenaghan. The association of both Denys and Apollyon with such characteristics as natural vitality, creative individuality, and strangeness is highlighted at the expense of the traditional distinctions made between Dionysus and Apollo in classical mythology. Indeed, some scholars suggest that the cults of the two gods were eventually assimilated one by the other in the classical world (see, for instance Walter F. Otto, Dionysus: Myth and Cult, Robert B. Palmer, trans. [Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1965], 207).


32. Ibid., 140; emphasis added.

33. Connor, "Myth as Multiplicity," 30-31. Connor goes on to point out (32-33) that "Pater apprehended myth as always in a state of Becoming" and "was little interested in patterns of historical reconciliation and progression." But Connor also admits that Pater's "relativistic viewpoint" necessarily implicates the "contemporary world" in moments of historical conflict between "earlier" and "later ways of thinking": a position that supports Pater's concern with both "the irresolvable ambiguity of myth" and, in my view, its cultural expressiveness.

34. McGrath makes a similar point in considering Pater's expressive and functionalist view of myth: "so with Pater both myth and philosophy express in their respective forms an indwelling spirit that is analogous to the cohesive and informing vision an artist renders in the concrete matter of his art" (201).

35. Cf. Burstein, 319. Burstein usefully charts the growing Victorian concern with the particular mode of thought informing mythic discourse: "Like the mythic mind, the language of myth seemed to have fused subjective and objective impressions; thus, in myth single words gathered many aspects of experiential phenomena into dense but coherent symbols."

36. Cf. Connor, 42, who makes a similar point but to support a more traditional reading of "Denys L'Auxerrois" as a tale which momentarily resolves
contradictions rather than emphasizing their inevitability in the modern age.


42. Pater, *Miscellaneous Studies*, 136. Sloane Frazier in "Two Pagan Studies" links monastery and pigeon-house in terms of their "artificiality and complacency" which Apollyon destroys in order to re-assert his "pagan harmony" (283-84).


44. Ibid., 131.


46. Ibid.

47. See Christine van Boheemen-Saaf, *Between Sacred and Profane: Narrative Design and the Logic of Myth from Chaucer to Coover* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1987). Mythic decomposition involves the distribution of a "complex of attributes" between different but related individuals. Pater does not literally split his mythological counterparts, but metaphorically suggests they are uneasily divided between opposing characteristics by signalling certain inexplicable but sudden reversals in their behaviour and demeanour. For example, Hermes finds Denys "like a double creature, of two natures, difficult or impossible to harmonise" (*Imaginary Portraits*, 75).


49. Ibid., 87.

50. Claude Lévi-Strauss, "The Structural Study of Myth," in *Structural

51. F. C. McGrath's treatment of Denys and Apollyon offers a similar perspective not so much through the expression of difference but by focussing on the artistic potential of the characters. For McGrath they represent a concept of "the artist as an alien figure cleansing his age" (98). However, such a reading does not take full account of the ways in which cleansing and creativity are simultaneously activated and thwarted in the narrative.

52. Pater, Imaginary Portraits, 67, 68.

53. Ibid., 68-69.

54. Pater, Miscellaneous Studies, 122.

55. Pater, Imaginary Portraits, 87.

56. Pater, Miscellaneous Studies, 144.

57. Ibid., 123, 122.


60. Pater, Imaginary Portraits, 70-71.

61. Pater, Miscellaneous Studies, 132.

62. Ibid., 146.

63. Pater, Imaginary Portraits, 57, 88.

64. Ibid., 60, 59, 75.

65. Pater, Miscellaneous Studies, 135.

66. Pater, Imaginary Portraits, 63-64; emphasis added.

67. Ibid., 76.

**Chapter 14: Pater and Architecture, Bernard Richards**


4. The "Postscript" was originally published as "Romanticism" in *Macmillan’s Magazine* (November 1876). It was revised for *Miscellaneous Studies* (1895), and the final paragraph was added.


6. Ibid., V, 245.

7. Ibid., V, 249.

8. Ibid., VIII, 132-33.


11. Ibid., III, 118.

12. Ibid., IV, 50.

13. Ibid., IV, 49.

14. Ibid., VI, 279.

15. Ibid., VIII, 127.

17. Ibid., VIII, 140.

18. Ibid., VIII, 141.

19. Ibid., VIII, 139.

20. Ibid., IX, 5.

21. Ibid., IX, 6.

22. Ibid., VIII, 109.

23. Ibid., VIII, 110.

24. Ibid., VIII, 115.

25. Ibid., VIII, 113-14.

26. Ibid., VIII, 119.

27. Ibid., VIII, 119.

28. Ibid., VIII, 135.

29. Ibid., IX, 77-78.

30. Ibid., I, 134.

31. Ibid., VIII, 178.

32. Ibid., VIII, 148.

33. Ibid., VIII, 152.

34. Ibid., VIII, 154.

35. Ibid., VI, 279.
36. Ibid., VIII, 155.

37. Ibid., I, 176.

38. Ibid., V, 23.

39. Ibid., V, 261.

40. In quoting this passage from the "Postcript" to Miscellaneous Studies (127) J. M. Crook mistakenly dates it 1874. In fact it is an addition of 1889. This means that it was written after work on T. G. Jackson's extraordinarily eclectic New Quad had begun at Pater's college, Brasenose.

41. All of these buildings are illustrated in Mark Girouard's The Victorian Country House (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1979) and his Sweetness and Light: the 'Queen Anne' Movement 1860-1910 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1977).

Chapter 15: The Crystal Man: A Study of "Diaphaneitè", Anne Varty


2. Walter Pater, "Diaphaneitè," Miscellaneous Studies, C. L. Shadwell, ed. (London: Macmillan, 1895), 259. The very title of the essay is mysterious. Diaphaneitè is not an English word, nor, as the accentuation suggests, is it a French word. If we transliterate Diaphaneitè into ancient Greek, it assumes the form of a second person plural imperative verb: "[You shall] become transparent!" or "shine through!" This reinforces the sense of the essay as a manifesto or imperative command for the future.

3. Inman, 74-75.


10. For Pater's early interest in Carlyle, see Inman, 7.

11. See Monsman, "Pater, Hopkins, and Fichte's Ideal Student."


15. G. H. Lewes, *The Life of Goethe* (1855; London: Smith, Elder and Co. [1863], 1864). A letter from Anthony Trollope to Lewes, dated 13 December 1863, thanking him for a copy of the *Life*, confirms its publication date. See *The George Eliot Letters*, Gordon S. Haight, ed. (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1978), VIII, 315. While there is no bibliographical evidence that Pater ever borrowed this book from a library, and he did not own a copy of it, Pater's interest in Goethe was so lively and the book so influential, that it is most improbable that he was not familiar with it.

16. Lewes, 259, 277, 299.

17. Ibid., 20.


19. Inman, 49.


23. Ibid., 713.


26. Lewes, 222.


33. Ibid., 80.

34. Ibid., 88.


38. Ibid., 122-23.


40. "Winckelmann," 86.

Chapter 16: Nineteenth-Century Responses to Montaigne and Bruno: A Context for Pater, *Jane Spirit*


4. I am most grateful to Mr. John Sparrow for permission to quote from the manuscripts in his possession. References to these unpublished chapters are denoted MS, followed by chapter and folio numbers.


9. Ibid., 4-6.

10. Cooper-Willis comments that the "the fact that Montaigne has been described by many writers as 'licentious,' in view of certain admissions of laxness in sex matters which he makes, has for many people disposed of the whole question of his 'morality,' as if morality and continence were one and the selfsame thing." See Irene Cooper-Willis, Montaigne (London: Alfred A. Knopf, 1927), 13.


17. In Lecky's view Montaigne deserved admiration for believing that "it was the part of a wise man to remain poised with an indifferent mind between opposing sects. As a consequence of this he taught . . . the innocence of error and the evil of persecution." W. E. H. Lecky, *The History of the Rise and Influence of the Spirit of Rationalism in Europe* (London: Green, Longmans, Roberts and Green, 1865), II, 63.


20. "George Sand," Ibid., 188.


23. Ibid., 136.

24. Ibid., 140.

25. Ibid., 141.

26. Pater's influence here may be detected in the enlarged version of "The Portrait of Mr. W. H.," in which Wilde discusses the Renaissance revival of the spirit of Hellenism and of Platonic theory. He mentions, for example, the love of "Michael Angelo" and "Tomanasio Cavalieri," saying that: "[t]he same idea is put forward in Montaigne's noble essay on Friendship, a passion which he ranks higher than the love of brother for brother, or the love of man for woman. See
Notes


28. Ibid., 131.

29. Ibid., 117.

30. Ibid., 130-31.

31. Ibid., 112, 144.

32. Ibid., MS, ch. 8, f.21.


38. Ibid., II, 96.


41. Ibid., 550.

42. In his address given on 9 August 1874, Tyndall suggested that by his insistence that "[m]atter is not the mere naked, empty capacity which philosophers have pictured her to be, but the universal mother" Bruno had come close to modern scientific thought. See John Tyndall, *Fragments of Science* (London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1879), 156.
43. Ian Frith comments that "by the way of poetry Bruno became a philosopher; Love of art made him a lover of men; love of the true and beautiful made him the worshipper of God." See Ian Frith, *The Life of Giordano Bruno* (London: Trubner, 1887), 307.

44. Lewes portrays Bruno as "a preacher, young, handsome, gay, and worldly as a poet, not as a fanatic." See G. H. Lewes, *Biographical History of Philosophy* (1845-1846; London: Parker and Son, 1857), 316.


47. R. C. Christie examined the evidence for Bruno having died at the stake and found it to be incontrovertible. His findings were disputed by J. P. B. Stuart, who scorned those wanting to erect a monument to Bruno's memory, a view which was in its turn dismissed by C. E. Plumptre. See: R. C. Christie, "Was Giordano Bruno Really Burned?" *Macmillan's Magazine*, 52 (May-Oct. 1885), 435-40; J. P. B. Stuart, *Essays on Foreign Subjects* (London: Alexander Gardner, 1901); and C. E. Plumptre, "Giordano Bruno and the Scottish Reviewer," *Antiquary* 19 (March and April 1889), 110-14 and 146-51.


53. Walter Pater, "Giordano Bruno, Paris: 1586," *Fortnightly Review*, 46 (August 1889), 234. Apart from the additional introduction establishing the figure of Gaston listening to Bruno there are no great differences between the article and chapter versions. However, the chapter does insert a new paragraph emphasizing the significance of Bruno's doctrine of indifference to Gaston (*Gaston*, 196-97). Other changes slightly alter the emphasis of the later version. In the article version, for example, Pater writes of how Bruno "the escaped monk, is still a monk: his philosophy, impious as it might seem to some, a new religion" (*Giordano Bruno," 241). In the chapter version this is made more emphatic by the alteration of the last clause to "a religion; very new indeed, yet a religion" (*Gaston*, 191). The "earlier physical impulses" which make Bruno always a "lover and a monk" despite the superseding of "religion and love" by intellectual ardour
("Giordano Bruno," 238) are, in the book version, made more specifically "physically erotic" impulses (Gaston, 181), associated with Bruno's early enthusiasm for "religion and physical love" (Gaston, 183).

54. Gaston, 175.
55. Ibid., 183.
56. Ibid., 123.
57. Ibid., 161.
58. Ibid., 200.
59. Ibid., MS, ch. 9, f. 16.
60. Ibid., ch. 9, f. 17.
61. Ibid., ch. 9, f. 21.
62. Ibid., ch. 10, f. 13.
63. Ibid., ch. 10, f. 14.
64. Ibid., ch. 10, f. 32.
65. Ibid., ch. 10, f. 33.
66. Ibid., ch. 10, f. 33.
67. Ibid., ch. 10, f. 37.
68. Ibid., ch. 10, f. 37.
69. Ibid., ch. 9, f. 6 and ch. 11, f. 37.
70. Ibid., ch. 11, f. 35.
71. Ibid., ch. 13, f. 21.